



**Forum: Challenges & Duels**

**Topic: Billy Vs. Winterhawk**

**Subject: Re: Billy and Winterhawk Challenge Judging**

Posted by: Kallisti

Posted on: 2004/10/23 9:47:38

ok, so here goes.

i'll start with billy's mad hatter: i have to say, i really like the creepiness in this piece. the hatter himself looks absolutely insane. i like his face, the way his eye bugs out at the viewer. the smoking pistol and steaming coffee go together nicely, but i think the hand holding the cup could do with a bit more edgework. plus, it looks like billy did an excellent job of making all the parts of the face the same color, which is very tricky indeed, so i think the hand could've been matched a bit better as well... i like the background, if i hadn't seen the base images provided for the duel, i would've had no idea that picture of arkham came from such a small line-art source.

moving on to winterhawk's piece, i do like the sequential page of artwork, like the page of a comic. technical execution of the manip is spot-on with the exception of two things. one, in the first panel, the image of arkham doesn't quite blend seamlessly with the lightning and the tree. two, the gun in the last panel seems a bit flat. however, the handmade backgrounds look fantastic, and all three villains look great. the entire page is engaging and holds my attention throughout the piece. i find myself wanting to know more of the story, which is a good thing.

overall, these are two very different pieces, each with its own strengths and weaknesses... both artists used all 9 of the base images (from what i can tell), both created very creepy scenarios. both images tell a story. but whereas billy's entry combined all the base images into one villain, and winterhawk used the base images to bring three to life, i've decided to cast my vote for winterhawk. great job by both artists, it's a privilege for me to be able to critique such cool works of art.

winner: the mad hatter's revenge by winterhawk